

---

**From:** Hawaii Sheep & Goat Association HSGA <hisheepandgoat@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 28, 2020 10:28 AM  
**To:** PUC  
**Cc:** [REDACTED] Nicole Galase; Tim Richards - Vet Associates (waikalandle@gmail.com); Yogi, Davis K  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Shipping device committee cost analysis  
**Attachments:** Current vs Proposed Analysis\_5\_23\_2020.pdf

To the PUC Commissioners,

This cost analysis is being submitted by the Livestock Shipping Committee that is represented by members of the industry in a variety of livestock species.

We are presenting this data to illustrate the significant increase in the cost of shipping livestock inter-island should LCL shipments and on-pier transfers be completely eliminated. This would have a devastating impact on the livestock industry's ability to operate and stay competitive.

There would be additional costs associated with new processes identified that are not yet listed here as the impact analysis continues.

We understand that Young Brothers have agreed to reinstate both of these processes conditioned upon a possible governmental grant that will carry them to the end of the year. However, we need to ensure that these processes that are so crucial to the survival of our industry not be jeopardized again in the future. Therefore, we are submitting this cost analysis so everyone understands the damaging impact that these restrictions would cause.

We would welcome the opportunity to present this data to the committee and answer any questions you might have.

*Sandra Tran, Vice Chair*

*President, Hawai'i Sheep and Goat Association*

*Dr. Tim Richards, Chair*

*Hawai'i County Councilman*

**Single Shipment Notes:**

This is a Trans-Shipment meaning that shipping a load from Maui to the Big Island requires a stop over in Oahu with an overnight stay due to sailing schedule. This scenario illustrates the financial impact from the restriction of 'no on pier transfers' to shippers  
 2. LCL container would be a 4x8x10 pen  
 This cost would be \$250 if animals could be picked up by the livestock care taker with a trailer, \$450 if the 20' container has to be transported to the quarantine station with an 18 wheeler  
 4. No on pier transfer of livestock as of 4/1/2020  
 There will be additional costs associated to new processes identified as we go along due to these the 'LCL' and 'on pier transfer' restrictions

**Scenario: Shipping a horse from Oahu to Kauai**

Ref	Task	<sup>1</sup> Box Stall (LCL shipment)	<sup>2</sup> 20' Container	Cost Increase on Full Container Loads	% Increase on Full Container Loads
1	Airport pick up, transport to quarantine for inspection, transport to layover barn	\$200	\$200	\$0	0%
2	Layover boarding until the next scheduled barge to Kauai (average charge)	\$160	\$160	\$0	0%
3	<sup>1</sup> Transfer from layover barn to Honolulu pier <sup>2</sup> Trucker has to go to the pier and pick up 20' container and go to the layover barn, load horse and take it back to the pier. Trucker fee \$130/hr, 4 hours minimum charge. * Potential additional fees for loading horse into 20' container (not done by trucker)	\$200	\$520	\$320	160%
4	<sup>1</sup> Box stall rental <sup>2</sup> YB 20' container rental with cattle ramp to load horse	\$160	\$350	\$190	119%
5	YB shipping fee from Honolulu to Kauai	\$150	\$750	\$600	400%
6	On pier transfer of horse from the box stall to a trailer for deliver to final destination, including cleaning fee	\$250		-\$250	-100%
7	Transport container from pier to off site staging area, wait for clean up and transport back to pier		\$770	\$770	
8	20' Container cleaning		\$150	\$150	
9	Horse delivery from off site staging area to final destination		\$500	\$500	
10	<sup>1</sup> YB empty box stall return fee <sup>2</sup> YB empty 20' container return fee	\$57	\$65	\$8	14%
11	Transport containers (LCL or 20' container) from pier back to the ranch	\$120	\$260	\$140	117%
	<b>Total Shipping Cost</b>	<b>\$1,297</b>	<b>\$3,725</b>	<b>\$2,428</b>	<b>187%</b>

**Trans Shipment Notes:**

This is a Trans-Shipment meaning that shipping a load from Maui to the Big Island requires a stop over in Oahu with an overnight stay due to sailing schedule. This scenario illustrates the financial impact from the restriction of 'no on pier transfers' to shippers  
 2. LCL container would be a 4x8x10 pen  
 This cost would be \$250 if animals could be picked up by the livestock care taker with a trailer, \$450 if the 20' container has to be transported to the quarantine station with an 18 wheeler  
 4. No on pier transfer of livestock as of 4/1/2020  
 There will be additional costs associated to new processes identified as we go along due to these the 'LCL' and 'on pier transfer' restrictions

**Scenario: Shipping 25 sheep from Maui to the Big Island**

Ref	Task	Box Stall (LCL shipment)	20' Container	Cost Increase on Full Container Loads	% Increase on Full Container Loads
1	Transportation cost from Maui ranch to Kahului pier	\$120	\$260	\$140	117%
2	Young Brothers shipping charge	\$346	\$998	\$652	188%
3	Transportation cost from Honolulu pier to quarantine station	\$180	\$280	\$100	56%
4	Cost of feed/water overnight and transport to quarantine station (see note 3 below)	\$250	\$450	\$200	80%
5	Transportation cost from quarantine station to Honolulu pier	\$180	\$280	\$100	56%
6	Transportation cost from Kawaihae pier to final destination	\$320	\$460	\$140	44%
8	Empty pen/container return to Maui	\$62	\$67	\$5	7%
	<b>Total Shipping Cost</b>	<b>\$1,459</b>	<b>\$2,795</b>	<b>\$1,336</b>	<b>92%</b>

FILED

2020 May 28 PM 15:48

PUBLIC UTILITIES  
COMMISSION

The foregoing document was electronically filed with the State of Hawaii Public Utilities Commission's Document Management System (DMS).