Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 44 of 51

X. PERFORMANCE METRICS

2	Q:	What performance metrics and standards will you be discussing?
3	A:	Pursuant to Order No. 33640, issued in Docket No. 2013-0032 on April
4		13, 2016, the Commission established performance standards related to
5		safety, efficiency, and service, to measure the Company's performance
6		while the Annual Freight Rate Adjustment ("AFRA") Pilot Program was in
7		effect. ²⁷ Of those performance standards, the following are relevant to
8		Terminal Operations:
9 10 11		(1) Safety: recordable incident rate (shoreside); lost time incident rate (shoreside); workers' compensation insurance claims; and hazardous materials.
12 13 14		(2) Efficiency: labor efficiency; fuel efficiency (shoreside); and container utilization.
15 16 17		(3) Service: customer wait time for freight; caller wait time; customer dropped calls; cargo insurance loss ratio.
18 19		In summary, for the twelve-month trailing period from July 2018 to
20		June 2019,28 the Company is meeting the performance standards for
21		almost every category listed above, including recordable incident rate
22		(shoreside), lost time incident rate (shoreside), workers' compensation
23		insurance claims related to the number of claims, hazardous materials,
24		labor efficiency related to revenue tons moved per labor hour, fuel
25		efficiency (shoreside), customer wait time for most types of freight, and

For a more detailed discussion regarding the history of the AFRA Pilot Program, development of the performance standards and metrics, and Young Brothers' recent performance, see YB T-2 (Testimony of Sandra Larsen) and YB-201 (Young Brothers, LLC 2019 Performance Results).
 Because this performance results update is being filed before the end of 2019, the data covers the twelve-month trailing period from July 2018 - June 2019, which is the most current available information. Young Brothers will provide the Commission with updated performance results to cover the full 2019 calendar year as an update to YB-201 when those results are available.

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 45 of 51

cargo insurance loss ratio. The Company has fallen short of the performance standard for labor efficiency related to dollar value of shoreside labor hours and customer wait time for a couple of cargo types. In addition, the Company is proposing in this rate case, but has not yet received approval of, a performance standard for container utilization. Nevertheless, it appears that utilization has increased for the vast majority of container types.

Please discuss the results for the safety-related metrics (i.e., recordable incident rate, lost time incident rate, workers' compensation insurance claims, and hazardous materials incidents). With regard to the Company's safety-related metrics, the Company met its performance standards in every category (see the tables below). Young Brothers is extremely proud of its employees for their efforts in this area because: (1) the Company did not meet its performance standards in 2017; and (2) safety is the Company's top priority.

The job that YB's employees perform is difficult and dangerous due to the high volume of cargo and the constant interaction of customers, truckers, heavy machinery, and employees. It is a testament to the employees' skill and situational awareness that they prioritize safety while effectively moving cargo in a fast paced environment to meet the needs of customers and the State more generally.

Q:

A:

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 46 of 51

	Recordable Incident	Rate ²⁹
Personnel ³⁰	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance
Shoreside	5.70 or lower	2.92

The state of the s	Lost Time Incident	Rate ³¹
Personnel ³²	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance
Shoreside	4.08 or lower	1.82

Workers' Compensation Claims				
Description	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance		
Number of	40 claims or lower	36 claims		
Claims				
Dollar Value	\$1,233,684 or lower	\$1,414,899		
of Claims ³³	<u> </u>			

Hazardous	Materials Incidents	
Description	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance
Number of Incidents ³⁴	7.3 incidents or fewer	2 incidents
Monetary Expenses Associated with Incidents ³⁵	\$55,514 or lower	\$13,227

1

2

3

²⁹ The rate is calculated by multiplying the number of recordable incidents by 200,000 (i.e., number of base hours that 100 full-time employees working 40 hours a week for 50 weeks would accumulate), and then dividing that product by the Company's total number of work hours for the year.

³⁰ Shoreside personnel include non-sea-going salaried employees and those employees covered under a collective bargaining agreement, including all maintenance staff. Marine personnel include all sea-going salaried employees and those employees covered under a collective bargaining agreement, including dispatch staff (management level personnel other than tug captains are excluded).

³¹ Similar to the recordable incident rate, the rate is calculated by multiplying the number of lost time incidents by 200,000 (i.e., number of base hours that 100 full-time employees working 40 hours a week for 50 weeks would accumulate), and then dividing that product by the Company's total number of work hours for the year.

³² See supra n.23.

³³ Dollar value of claims consists of amounts that have actually been paid out on workers' compensation insurance claims during the calendar year.

³⁴ YB counts hazardous materials incidents as only those incidents that are reportable to external agencies. In other words, if a spill is so small or insignificant that it is not reportable to an external agency, then Young Brothers does not include that incident for purposes of this performance metric.

³⁵ Monetary expenses associated with YB's hazardous materials incidents include readily identifiable invoices and expenses directly associated with such spills, and do not include internal labor or other costs that are difficult to isolate from other aggregated operational expenses.

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 47 of 51

1 Q: Please discuss the results for the efficiency-related metrics (i.e., 2 labor efficiency, fuel efficiency - shoreside, and container utilization). 3 A: With regard to the Company's efficiency-related metrics, the Company 4 met its performance standards in every category except "dollar value of 5 shoreside labor hours." As the Company stated in previous filings, labor 6 hours is a better efficiency measure than dollar value of labor hours. 7 because labor costs are generally always rising due to increasing wage 8 rates.³⁶ Young Brothers is also proposing a new metric and performance 9 standard for container utilization in this rate case, and provides its

performance in the chart below.

	Labor Efficiency		
Description	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Revenue Tons/ Shoreside Labor Hours ³⁷	15.01 tons/hour or higher	15.21 tons/hour	
Dollar Value of Shoreside Labor Hours	\$18,928,710 or lower	\$20,424,685	

¹¹

³⁶ <u>See</u> Young Brothers, Limited's Submission of Supplemental Information as Required by Order No. 33640, filed on July 12, 2016, in Docket No. 2013-0032, at 38-39; <u>see also</u> 2016 Performance Results at 10.

³⁷ Cargo volumes from YB's combined intrastate and interstate lines of business are used to derive revenue tons. Only "loaded" cargo is counted and empty shipping devices are excluded. Total (intrastate and interstate) shoreside labor hours excludes salaried employees and maintenance personnel, to ensure that labor hours are limited to only those associated with cargo handling activities, and further, only includes hours that are "worked" (i.e., not non-working holiday or sick leave hours).

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 48 of 51

	Fuel Efficiency ³⁸	ıel Efficiency ³⁸	
Description	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Shoreside Fuel Efficiency	11.55 tons/gallon or higher	12.25 tons/gallon	

	Container Utilization Efficiency ³⁹				
Container Type	Proposed Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	YB's 2018 Performance		
40' Dry Container	80% - 90%	77.7%	72.5%		
40' Reefer Container	80% - 90%	78.1%	74.6%		
40' Flat Rack	80% - 90%	87.0%	82.4%		
40' Platform	80% - 90%	85.5%	85.6%		
40' Chassis	80% - 90%	96.6%	95.5%		
20' Dry Container	80% - 90%	91.1%	87.9%		
20' Reefer Container	80% - 90%	83.6%	84.9%		
20' Flat Rack	80% - 90%	91.4%	90.9%		
20' Platform	80% - 90%	93.7%	93.5%		
20' Chassis	80% - 90%	92.4%	91.4%		
Gvan	80% - 90%	89.8%	90.2%		

2

³ 4

³⁸ The fuel efficiency standards measure revenue tons of cargo moved per gallon of fuel consumed in moving cargo. Cargo volumes from YB's combined intrastate and interstate lines of business are used to derive revenue tons. In contrast to the "loaded" cargo tonnage used to measure labor efficiency, the fuel efficiency metric is derived by using both "loaded" and "empty" cargo tonnage. Fuel used for non-cargo movements is excluded (e.g., fuel used by tugs providing harbor assists for other companies).

³⁹ The fuel efficiency standards measure revenue tons of cargo moved per gallon of fuel consumed in moving cargo. Cargo volumes from YB's combined intrastate and interstate lines of business are used to derive revenue tons. In contrast to the "loaded" cargo tonnage used to measure labor efficiency, the fuel efficiency metric is derived by using both "loaded" and "empty" cargo tonnage. Fuel used for non-cargo movements is excluded (e.g., fuel used by tugs providing harbor assists for other companies).

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 49 of 51

- Q: Please discuss the results for the service-related metrics (i.e.,
 customer wait time for freight, caller wait time, customer dropped
- 3 calls, and cargo insurance loss ratio).
- 4 A: With regard to the Company's service-related metrics, the Company met 5 its performance standards in certain customer wait time categories and 6 cargo insurance loss ratio. Unfortunately, the Company has incomplete 7 data and cannot determine if it met its performance data for caller wait 8 time and customer dropped calls, as well as customer wait times for 9 freight in Kahului and Hilo due to technical and employee turnover issues, 10 respectively. As discussed in greater detail in YB-201, phone-related 11 performance is incomplete because of a loss of a server and the 12 malfunction of the other, and customer wait time for freight performance is 13 incomplete for Kahului and Hilo due to turnover in security personnel who 14 collect the data and Port Managers that oversee all port operations.

Customer	Customer Wait Time for Freight - Honolulu				
Cargo Type	Performance Standard ⁴⁰	YB's 2019 Performance			
Dry Pallet LCL	45 minutes	51 minutes			
Refrigerated LCL	45 minutes	37 minutes			
Mixed Cargo ⁴¹	45 minutes	43 minutes			
Auto/RoRo	45 minutes	49 minutes			
Container	45 minutes	29 minutes			

⁴⁰ As set forth in its 2016 Performance Results, to maintain consistency with the standards established by the Commission for dry LCL and refrigerated LCL at Honolulu, YB proposes the same performance standard of 45 minutes for the additional cargo types. <u>See</u> 2016 Performance Results at 16.

⁴¹ Mixed Cargo consists of dry mixed LCL.

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 50 of 51

Customer Wait Time for Freight - Kahului			
Cargo Type	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Dry Pallet LCL	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Refrigerated LCL	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Mixed Cargo	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Auto/RoRo	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Container	45 minutes	Incomplete	

Customer Wait Time for Freight - Hilo			
Cargo Type	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Dry Pallet LCL	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Refrigerated LCL	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Mixed Cargo	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Auto/RoRo	45 minutes	Incomplete	
Container	45 minutes	Incomplete	

1

2

3

4

Customer Wait Time for Freight - Nawiliwili			
Cargo Type	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Dry Pallet LCL	45 minutes	24 minutes	
Refrigerated LCL	45 minutes	22 minutes	
Mixed Cargo	45 minutes	24 minutes	
Auto/RoRo	45 minutes	28 minutes	
Container	45 minutes	33 minutes	

Customer Wait Time for Freight - Kawaihae			
Cargo Type	Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
Dry Pallet LCL	45 minutes	33 minutes	
Refrigerated LCL	45 minutes	23 minutes	
Mixed Cargo	45 minutes	46 minutes	
Auto/RoRo	45 minutes	32 minutes	
Container	45 minutes	26 minutes	

Caller Wait Time			
Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance ⁴²		
90% of all calls answered within 60 seconds	Incomplete		

 $^{^{\}rm 42}$ YB's call response performance is measured using data from its telephone software system.

Docket No. 2019-0117 YB T-3 Page 51 of 51

Customer Dropped Calls		
Performance Standard	YB's 2019 Performance	
5% or less	Incomplete	

Cargo Insurance Loss RatioDescriptionPerformance
StandardYB's 2019
PerformanceCargo Insurance Loss
Ratio20.7% or lower19.0%Cargo Damage Claims43437 or lower404 claims

3 Q: Does this conclude your testimony?

1

2

5

4 A: Yes, it does. Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

⁴³ The number of cargo damage claims reflects only those damage claims that have been approved and paid, and excludes denied claims.